

On the differentiability of absolutely continuous functions. (**)

CESARI [1] has shown that a continuous function $f(x, y)$ which is absolutely continuous in the sense of TONELLI and whose derivatives are in L^p , $p > 2$, has a total differential in the sense of STOLZ almost everywhere. This is no longer true for $p = 2$, but the result can be improved in the following manner. Let $\varphi(t)$ be a non negative convex increasing function, defined for $0 \leq t < +\infty$ such that $\varphi(0) = 0$. Following ORLICZ, let us denote by L_φ the class of all functions f for which there exists a constant λ , depending on f , such that

$$\int \varphi\left(\frac{|f|}{\lambda}\right) d\sigma < \infty;$$

then if f is continuous and absolutely continuous in the sense of TONELLI and $(f_x^2 + f_y^2)^{1/2}$ belongs to L_φ locally, $\varphi(t)$ being a function such that

$$\int_1^\infty \frac{t}{\varphi(t)} dt < \infty,$$

f has a total differential almost everywhere. This result is in a sense the best possible. In fact given any $\varphi(t)$ such that

$$\int_1^\infty \frac{t}{\varphi(t)} dt = \infty,$$

there exists a function f which is continuous and absolutely continuous, such that $(f_x^2 + f_y^2)^{1/2}$ belongs to L_φ locally, and which fails to have a total differential almost everywhere.

The general result concerning functions of n variables can be stated as follows: if f is continuous and absolutely continuous in the sense of TONELLI

(*) Address: Department of Mathematics, The Ohio State University, Columbus 10, Ohio, U.S.A..

(**) Received February 20, 1951.

and $|\text{grad } f|$ belongs locally to L_φ , where φ is a function such that

$$\int_1^\infty \left[\frac{t}{\varphi(t)} \right]^{n-1} dt < \infty,$$

f has a total differential in the sense of STOLZ almost everywhere. Functions of this class satisfy the inequality (5) and therefore belong to the class of φ -Lipschitzian functions suggested by T. RADÓ. As pointed out by RADÓ, on account of a result of STEPANOFF [2], φ -Lipschitzian functions have a total differential almost everywhere; but we shall prove the existence of the differential directly to avoid reference to STEPANOFF's result which is far from being elementary.

Let $f(P)$, $P = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$, be continuous and absolutely continuous in the n -dimensional unit cube K_0 , $0 \leq x_i \leq 1$. It is known that for almost every point Q and almost every straight line going through Q , $f(P)$ is an absolutely continuous function of the distance between P and Q . Moreover if $\alpha_1, \alpha_2, \dots, \alpha_n$ are the direction cosines of the line and f_1, f_2, \dots, f_n , denote the partial derivatives of f , then $\frac{df}{ds} = \sum \alpha_i f_i$ for almost every s .

Let now Q and Q' be two points in K_0 such that f is absolutely continuous on almost every line through Q or Q' , d be the distance between Q and Q' and D the disc of radius $\frac{d}{2\sqrt{n}}$ with center at the mid-point of the segment QQ' and contained in the hyperplane perpendicular to QQ' . Assume that D is entirely in K_0 and denote by γ and γ' the cones projecting D from Q and Q' respectively. If P is a point on D such that f is absolutely continuous on the segments PQ and PQ' , then

$$|f(Q) - f(Q')| \leq |f(P) - f(Q)| + |f(P) - f(Q')|$$

and

$$|f(P) - f(Q)| = \int_{QP} \left(\frac{df}{ds} \right) ds \leq \int_{QP} \left| \frac{df}{ds} \right| ds,$$

where the integral is taken over the segment PQ . But almost everywhere in s we have

$$\frac{df}{ds} = \sum_1^n \alpha_i f_i \quad \text{and} \quad \left| \frac{df}{ds} \right| \leq |\text{grad } f|,$$

and therefore

$$|f(P) - f(Q)| \leq \int_{PQ} |\text{grad } f| \, ds,$$

and similarly we obtain

$$|f(P) - f(Q')| \leq \int_{PQ'} |\text{grad } f| \, ds,$$

and collecting both inequalities together we find that

$$(1) \quad |f(Q) - f(Q')| \leq \int_{PQ} |\text{grad } f| \, ds + \int_{PQ'} |\text{grad } f| \, ds.$$

Denote now by $d\Omega_Q$ the element of solid angle projecting from Q the element of area on D . Then $d\Omega_Q = d\Omega_{Q'}$ and

$$\int_D d\Omega_Q = \Omega,$$

where Ω is a fixed number independent of the distance between Q and Q' . Let us integrate (1) with respect to $d\Omega_Q$ over D

$$\begin{aligned} \int_D |f(Q) - f(Q')| \, d\Omega_Q &= \Omega |f(Q) - f(Q')| \leq \\ &\leq \int_D d\Omega_Q \int_{PQ} |\text{grad } f| \, ds + \int_D d\Omega_{Q'} \int_{PQ'} |\text{grad } f| \, ds. \end{aligned}$$

Now if dv denotes the element of volume in K_0 and ρ and ρ' the distances to Q and Q' respectively it is not difficult to see that the foregoing repeated integrals are equal to volume integrals, namely

$$\int_D d\Omega_Q \int_{QP} |\text{grad } f| \, ds = \int_{\gamma} \frac{1}{\rho^{n-1}} |\text{grad } f| \, dv$$

and

$$\int_D d\Omega_{Q'} \int_{Q'P} |\text{grad } f| \, ds = \int_{\gamma'} \frac{1}{\rho'^{n-1}} |\text{grad } f| \, dv,$$

where γ and γ' are the cones introduced above. Therefore the preceding inequality can be written

$$\Omega |f(Q) - f(Q')| \leq \int_{\gamma} \frac{1}{\rho^{n-1}} |\text{grad } f| \, dv + \int_{\gamma'} \frac{1}{\rho'^{n-1}} |\text{grad } f| \, dv.$$

Let now Q be fixed and K a cube with center at Q and entirely contained in K_0 . If Q' is any point of K , the cores γ and γ' constructed on the segment QQ' as above, are entirely contained in K ; in fact, if 2δ denotes the length of the edge of K , the distance between the mid-point of QQ' and the boundary of K is never less than $\delta/2$, and the length of QQ' never exceeds $\sqrt{n}\delta$, so that the radius of D never exceeds $\delta/2$ and therefore D and a fortiori also γ and γ' are entirely contained in K . On account of this we have

$$\begin{aligned} \Omega |f(Q) - f(Q')| &\leq \int_{\gamma} \frac{1}{\rho^{n-1}} |\text{grad } f| \, dv + \int_{\gamma'} \frac{1}{\rho'^{n-1}} |\text{grad } f| \, dv \leq \\ &\leq \int_K \left(\frac{1}{\rho^{n-1}} + \frac{1}{\rho'^{n-1}} \right) |\text{grad } f| \, dv. \end{aligned}$$

Now if R is a point in K and $|P - R|$ is the distance between P and R it follows that

$$(2) \quad |f(Q) - f(Q')| \leq \frac{2}{\Omega} \sup_{R \in K} \int_K \frac{|\text{grad } f(P)|}{|R - P|^{n-1}} \, dv.$$

Our next step will be to obtain inequality (5). For this purpose suppose that $|\text{grad } f|$ belongs to L_φ where φ is an increasing convex function such that $\varphi(0) = 0$ and

$$(3) \quad A = \int_0^\infty \left[\frac{t}{\varphi(t)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} dt < \infty.$$

Denote by E_m the set of points of K where

$$2^m \leq |\text{grad } f| < 2^{m+1}.$$

Then

$$\int_K \frac{|\text{grad } f|}{|R - P|^{n-1}} \, dv \leq \sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} 2^{m+1} \int_{E_m} \frac{dv}{|R - P|^{n-1}}.$$

Now it is not difficult to see that the integral

$$\int_{E_m} \frac{dv}{|R - P|^{n-1}}$$

is less than or equal to the same integral extended over the sphere with center at R and of the same measure as E_m . Therefore if w denotes the measure

of the sphere of radius 1, the radius of that sphere is

$$\left(\frac{|E_m|}{\omega}\right)^{1/n}$$

and therefore

$$\int_{E_m} \frac{dv}{|R - P|^{n-1}} \leq \int_0^{\left(\frac{|E_m|}{\omega}\right)^{1/n}} \frac{1}{\varrho^{n-1}} d(\varrho^n \omega) = n\omega^{\frac{n-1}{n}} |E_m|^{1/n}.$$

Replacing above we get

$$(4) \quad \int_K \frac{|\text{grad } f|}{|R - P|^{n-1}} dv \leq \sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} 2^{m+1} n \omega^{\frac{n-1}{n}} |E_m|^{1/n} = \\ = 2n\omega^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} 2^m |E_m|^{1/n} \frac{\varphi(2^m)^{1/n}}{\varphi(2^m)^{1/n}}$$

and applying HÖLDER'S inequality to the last sum, we find that

$$\sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} 2^m |E_m|^{1/n} \frac{\varphi(2^m)^{1/n}}{\varphi(2^m)^{1/n}} \leq \left[\sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} |E_m| \varphi(2^m) \right]^{1/n} \left[\sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \left[\frac{2^{nm}}{\varphi(2^m)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} \right]^{\frac{n-1}{n}}.$$

Now, on account of the definition of E_m we have

$$\sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} |E_m| \varphi(2^m) \leq \int_K \varphi(|\text{grad } f|) dv ;$$

on the other hand since $\varphi(t)$ is an increasing function

$$\left[\frac{2^{nm}}{\varphi(2^m)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} \leq \int_{m-1}^m \left[\frac{2^{n(s+1)}}{\varphi(2^s)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} ds$$

and therefore

$$\sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \left[\frac{2^{nm}}{\varphi(2^m)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} \leq \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \left[\frac{2^{n(s+1)}}{\varphi(2^s)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} ds$$

and introducing the variable $t = 2^s$ in the integral we obtain

$$\sum_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \left[\frac{2^{nm}}{\varphi(2^m)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} \leq c \int_0^{\infty} \left[\frac{t}{\varphi(t)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} dt = cA ,$$

where A is a constant depending on n .

Replacing, the inequality (4) becomes

$$\int_K \frac{|\text{grad } f(P)|}{|R-P|^{n-1}} dv \leq cA^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \left[\int_K \varphi(|\text{grad } f|) dv \right]^{1/n}$$

and the inequality (2) reduces to

$$(5) \quad |f(Q) - f(Q')| \leq cA^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \left[\int_K \varphi(|\text{grad } f|) dv \right]^{1/n},$$

where the letters c denote constants depending on n .

The inequality (5) holds for any two points Q and Q' provided Q' belongs to K . This follows from the fact that it certainly holds for almost every Q and almost every Q' and that both sides are continuous functions of Q , Q' and the length of the edge of K . Furthermore, the convexity of φ has not been used in the argument, so that (5) holds also for non-convex functions φ provided the remaining assumptions are satisfied.

The proof of the differentiability of f almost everywhere depends now only on one additional fact, namely that for almost every Q and for cubes K with center at Q we have

$$(6) \quad \lim_{|K| \rightarrow 0} \frac{1}{|K|} \int_K \varphi[|\text{grad } f(P) - \text{grad } f(Q)|] dv = 0.$$

Let us sketch the proof of this. Without loss of generality we may assume that also $\varphi[2|\text{grad } f|]$ is integrable; then for any vector \mathbf{a}_r with rational components and any rational number s the function $\varphi[|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r| + s]$ is integrable and outside a set of measure zero for every Q and any \mathbf{a}_r and s we have

$$\lim_{|K| \rightarrow 0} \frac{1}{|K|} \int_K \varphi[|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r| + s] dv = \varphi[|\text{grad } f(Q) - \mathbf{a}_r| + s].$$

For the same Q and any vector \mathbf{a} we have

$$(\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}) = (\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r) + (\mathbf{a}_r - \mathbf{a})$$

and, if $s > |\mathbf{a}_r - \mathbf{a}|$,

$$|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r| - s \leq |\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}| \leq |\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r| + s,$$

$$\varphi[|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r| - s] \leq \varphi[|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}|] \leq \varphi[|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}_r| + s].$$

Averaging the last inequality over K , letting $|K| \rightarrow 0$ and then making

$\mathbf{a}_r \rightarrow \mathbf{a}$ and $s \rightarrow 0$ we get

$$\lim_{|K| \rightarrow 0} \frac{1}{|K|} \int_K \varphi[|\text{grad } f - \mathbf{a}|] \, dv = \varphi[|\text{grad } f(Q) - \mathbf{a}|].$$

Replacing \mathbf{a} by $\text{grad } f(Q)$ the desired result follows.

Going back to the function f let Q be a point where (6) holds and let $g(P)$ be $g(P) = f(P) - f(Q) - \sum_1^n \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}(Q)(x_i - \bar{x}_i)$ where the x_i denote the coordinates of P and the \bar{x}_i those of Q . If K is a cube with center at Q and Q' is a point of the boundary of K , inequality (5) gives

$$|g(Q') - g(Q)| = |g(Q')| \leq cA^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \left[\int_K \varphi[|\text{grad } g|] \, dv \right]^{1/n}$$

and since $\text{grad } g(P) = \text{grad } f(P) - \text{grad } f(Q)$ and $|K| \leq 2^n |Q - Q'|^n$ we have

$$|g(Q')| \leq 2cA^{\frac{n-1}{n}} |Q - Q'| \left[\frac{1}{|K|} \int_K \varphi[|\text{grad } f(P) - \text{grad } f(Q)|] \, dv \right]^{1/n}.$$

When $|K| \rightarrow 0$ the quantity in the bracket tends to zero so that setting $Q' = P$ we get

$$\frac{|g(P)|}{|P - Q|} = \frac{\left| f(P) - f(Q) - \sum_1^n \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_i}(Q)(x_i - \bar{x}_i) \right|}{|P - Q|} \rightarrow 0,$$

as $P \rightarrow Q$. In other words $f(P)$ has a total differential at the point Q and the proof of the result is complete.

We shall prove now that given an increasing convex function $\varphi(t)$ such that $\varphi(0) = 0$ and

$$\int_1^\infty \left[\frac{t}{\varphi(t)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} dt = \infty,$$

there exists a continuous function f which is absolutely continuous, such that $|\text{grad } f| \in L_\varphi$ and which fails to have a total differential almost everywhere. This can be viewed as being a consequence of the fact that under those assumptions there exists a function $F(P) \geq 0$ depending only on the distance ϱ between P and the origin of coordinates which is a continuously differentiable decreasing function of ϱ for $\varrho > 0$ and such that $F(P) \rightarrow \infty$ as $\varrho \rightarrow 0$ and $\int \varphi[|\text{grad } F(P)|] \, dv \leq 1$. Once the existence of F is established the function f can be constructed as follows:

Denote by P_h^k the points interior to the unit cube K_0 whose coordinates are integral multiples of $\frac{1}{2^k}$ and let E_k be the union of the spheres of radius $\frac{1}{4^k}$ with centers at the P_h^k . Since there are less than 2^{kn} points P_h^k in K_0 we have $|E_k| < \omega \frac{1}{2^{kn}}$, where ω denotes the volume of the sphere of radius 1. Furthermore call

$$F_k(\varrho) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } \varrho \geq \frac{1}{4^k}, \\ \inf \left[4^{kn} \left(\frac{2}{3} \right)^k; F(\varrho) - F\left(\frac{1}{4^k}\right) \right] & \text{if } 0 \leq \varrho < \frac{1}{4^k}. \end{cases}$$

On account of the properties of $F(\varrho)$ it is apparent that $F_k(\varrho)$ satisfies a uniform LIPSCHITZ condition, that $F_k(0) = 4^{kn} \left(\frac{2}{3} \right)^k$ and

$$\int \varphi[|\text{grad } F_k|] dv \leq 1.$$

Now define

$$G_k(P) = \sum_h F_k(|P - P_h^k|)$$

and

$$f(P) = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} G_k(P).$$

Since $G_k(P)$ is continuous and $G_k(P) \leq 4^{kn} \left(\frac{2}{3} \right)^k$, $f(P)$ is continuous; on the other hand

$$\int_{K_0} \varphi(|\text{grad } G_k|) dv \leq 2^{kn}$$

and applying JENSEN's inequality we have

$$\begin{aligned} \int_K \varphi[|\text{grad } f|] dv &\leq \int_{K_0} \varphi \left[\sum_1^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} |\text{grad } G_k| \right] dv \leq \\ &\leq \int_{K_0} \varphi \left[\frac{\sum_1^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} |\text{grad } G_k|}{\sum_1^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}}} \right] dv \leq \frac{\sum_1^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} \int_{K_0} [|\text{grad } G_k|] dv}{\sum_1^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}}} < \infty \end{aligned}$$

so that $\varphi[|\text{grad } f|]$ is integrable and $|\text{grad } f|$ belongs to \mathcal{L}_φ .

Let now $D_l = \bigcup_{k=l}^{\infty} E_k$; then $D_l \supset D_{l+1}$ and $\lim_{l \rightarrow \infty} |D_l| = 0$ so that the set $D = \bigcap_1^{\infty} D_k$ is of measure zero. If Q is a point not in D , Q does not belong to D_l for some l , and since $G_k(P)$ vanishes outside E_k it vanishes outside D_l for $k \geq l$, so that

$$f(Q) = \sum_{k=1}^{l-1} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} G_k(Q)$$

and therefore

$$\frac{f(P) - f(Q)}{|P - Q|} = \sum_{k=1}^{l-1} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} \frac{G_k(P) - G_k(Q)}{|P - Q|} + \sum_l^{\infty} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} \frac{G_k(P)}{|P - Q|}.$$

Now, it is possible to select a sequence $P_{h(m)}^m$ among the points P_h^k such that $P_{h(m)}^m \rightarrow Q$ as m tends to infinity, more precisely, such that $|P_{h(m)}^m - Q| \leq \sqrt{n} \frac{1}{2^m}$. Since $G_m(P_h^m) = 4^{km} \left(\frac{2}{3}\right)^k$,

$$\frac{G_m[P_{h(m)}^m]}{|P_{h(m)}^m - Q|} \geq \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} 2^m 4^{km} \left(\frac{2}{3}\right)^m$$

and, replacing above we get for $m \geq l$,

$$\frac{f[P_{h(m)}^m] - f(Q)}{|P_{h(m)}^m - Q|} \geq \sum_{k=1}^{l-1} \frac{1}{4^{kn}} \frac{G_k[P_{h(m)}^m] - G_k(Q)}{|P_{h(m)}^m - Q|} + \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \left(\frac{4}{3}\right)^m.$$

Each of the $G_k(P)$ satisfies a uniform LIPSCHITZ condition so that the summation sign on the right is bounded and thus

$$\lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f[P_{h(m)}^m] - f(Q)}{|P_{h(m)}^m - Q|} = \infty.$$

Therefore f is not differentiable at Q , that is f fails to have a total differential outside D .

Now it remains only to construct the function $F(\varphi)$. We shall restrict ourselves to consider the case where $\varphi(t)/t$, which on account of the convexity of φ is non-decreasing, actually tends to infinity as $t \rightarrow \infty$. When $\varphi(t)/t$ is bounded, the gradient of every absolutely continuous function belongs to L_φ .

Let

$$\Phi(t) = \int_1^t \left[\frac{s}{\varphi(s)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} ds$$

and consider the function

$$s = \left[\frac{t}{\varphi(t)} \right]^{\frac{1}{n-1}} \frac{1}{\Phi(t)} = \frac{\Phi'(t)}{\Phi(t)}.$$

This function is continuous, strictly decreasing, it tends to zero as $t \rightarrow \infty$ and to infinity as $t \rightarrow 1$; therefore it has an inverse $t = h(s)$ defined for all values of $s > 0$. Moreover we shall have

$$(7) \quad \int_0^1 h(s) ds = \infty, \quad \int_0^1 \varphi[h(s)] s^{n-1} ds < \infty.$$

To show this we shall first remark that since $\Phi'(t)$ is decreasing we have

$$(8) \quad \frac{\Phi(t)}{t} \varphi \frac{\Phi(t)}{t-1} \geq \Phi'(t).$$

Then

$$\int_{\varepsilon}^1 h(s) ds = \int_{\varepsilon}^1 t ds = st \Big|_{\varepsilon}^1 + \int_{t(1)}^{t(\varepsilon)} s dt.$$

Now as $s \rightarrow 0$, t tends to infinity so that the integrated term

$$st = \frac{\Phi'(t)}{\Phi(t)} t$$

remains bounded on account of (8). On the other hand the integral

$$\int s dt = \int \frac{\Phi'(t)}{\Phi(t)} dt$$

diverges because $\Phi(t) \rightarrow \infty$ as $t \rightarrow \infty$ so that

$$\int_0^1 h(s) ds = \infty.$$

Consider now

$$\int_0^1 \varphi[h(s)] s^{n-1} ds = \int_0^1 \varphi(t) \frac{t}{\varphi(t)\Phi(t)^{n-1}} ds = \int_0^1 \frac{t}{\Phi(t)^{n-1}} ds.$$

Again on account of (8) we can integrate by parts the last integral and its convergence is reduced to that of

$$\int_0^{\infty} \left[\frac{\Phi'(t)}{\Phi(t)^n} - \frac{(n-1)\Phi'(t)^2 t}{\Phi(t)^{n+1}} \right] dt.$$

But this integral is convergent as it is easily seen on account of (8).

Thus (7) is established.

Finally suppose that

$$\int_0^{\alpha} \varphi[h(s)]s^{\alpha-1} ds \leq 1$$

and define

$$F(\varrho) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{for } \varrho \geq \alpha, \\ \int_{\varrho}^{\alpha} [h(s) - h(\alpha)] ds & \text{for } 0 < \varrho \leq \alpha. \end{cases}$$

Now owing to (7) it is readily seen that $F(\varrho)$ has the desired properties.

This completes the argument.

References.

- [1] L. CESARI, *Sulle funzioni assolutamente continue in due variabili*, Ann. Scuola Norm. Super. Pisa (2) **10**, 91-101 (1941).
- [2] W. STEPANOFF, *Sur les conditions de l'existence de la différentielle totale*, Rec. Math. Soc. Math. Moscou **32**, 511-526 (1925).